



WISCONSIN LEGISLATURE

P. O. Box 7882 Madison, WI 53707-7882

March 15, 2023

Attn: Robert M. Califf, M.D., MACC
Commissioner of Food and Drugs
Food and Drug Administration
White Oak Campus
10903 New Hampshire Avenue
Silver Spring MD, 20993

RE: FDA-2023-D-0451 Draft Guidance for Industry: Labeling of Plant-Based Milk Alternatives and Voluntary Nutrient Statements

Dear Dr. Califf:

On behalf of Wisconsin's Dairy Industry, which includes over 6,500 dairy farms and dairy processors, **we are contacting you to request revisions to the draft guidance for the labeling of plant-based milk alternatives (PBMA). Please revise the guidance to make it indisputable that products made from nuts, seeds, plants and algae are prohibited from using terms such as milk, yogurt or cheese.** Agriculture is the second leading industry in Wisconsin, contributing \$104.8 billion to our economy, and dairy accounts for almost half that total.

The long awaited U.S. Food & Drug Administration (FDA) action on the labeling of PBMA fails to address the concerns of our constituents in the dairy industry and is a disservice to the consumers who may purchase these products. The current Code of Federal Regulations—Title 21 FDA clearly defines milk products as originating exclusively or principally from animal sources:

“1240.3(j) Milk products. Food products made exclusively or principally from the lacteal secretion obtained from one or more healthy milk-producing animals, e.g., cows, goats, sheep, and water buffalo,…”

Dairy products are often touted nutritionally as a source of calcium, and while dairy products are calcium-powerhouses, the other essential nutrients they provide are important in the overall diet. It is difficult to obtain those nutrients without drinking or eating real dairy. Protein is one of those important nutrients. For instance, almond beverages contain only 1-2 grams of protein compared to 8 grams of protein per each cup of cow's milk. Plus, cow's milk is a source of high-quality or complete protein, meaning it provides all of the essential building blocks to build and repair muscle, provide proper immune function, and support good health.

In the draft guidance, the FDA takes the position that PBMA are non-standardized foods because no definition or standard of identity has been prescribed for them by regulation. Accordingly, the FDA maintains PBMA must be labeled with their common or usual names, or in the absence

thereof, a statement of identity that accurately describes them. While "plant-based" or "plant" may be used to describe PBMA, the FDA, in the draft guidance, does not recommend using only these terms, since "plant-based milk" is not the common or usual name of PBMA.

Per the FDA, since PBMA are not milk, they may not be offered for sale as "milk," although they may use the word "milk" in labeling, as long as it is qualified by the plant source. Notably, however, with such usage of the word "milk," the FDA recommends that PBMA products that have a nutrient composition different than milk bear an additional nutrient statement on the product label. This statement, which is voluntary, should, according to the FDA, describe how the PBMA product compares with milk, based on the U.S. Department of Agriculture's (USDA) Food and Nutrition Service (FNS) fluid milk substitutes nutrient criteria.

Many of the companies offering PBMA have to deal with these requirements in Europe. The European Union's (EU) top court has ruled that milk and dairy replacements that are being marketed and sold within the EU cannot have the word "milk" or "butter" in their names. This includes products such as soy milk, tofu butter, vegan cheeses, and other soy foods that act as dairy replacements. The court said, "Purely plant-based products cannot, in principle, be marketed with designations such as 'milk', 'cream', 'butter', 'cheese' or 'yoghurt', which are reserved by EU law for animal products."

The FDA should have been enforcing the current Code of Federal Regulations all along. The draft guidance recommendation for a voluntary statement on the nutritional differences is completely inadequate and contrary to federal code. **Please revise the guidance to make it indisputable that products made from nuts, seeds, plants and algae are prohibited from using terms such as milk, yogurt or cheese.** We urge you to heed our concerns and make wholesale revisions to the draft guidance.

Thank you for considering our request and we look forward to revised final guidance.

Sincerely,

Howard Marklein
State Senator
17th Senate District

Robert Cowles
State Senator
2nd Senate District

Donna Rozar
State Representative
69th Assembly District

Tony Kurtz
State Representative
50th Assembly District

Jerry O'Connor
State Representative
52nd Assembly District

Nate Gustafson
State Representative
55th Assembly District

Joel Kitchens
State Representative
1st Assembly District

Dave Murphy
State Representative
56th Assembly District

Ellen Schutt
State Representative
31st Assembly District

Van Wanggaard
State Senator
21st Senate District

Joy Goeben
State Representative
5th Assembly District

Todd Novak
State Representative
51st Assembly District

Dan Feyen
State Senator
18th Senate District

Rick Gundrum
State Representative
58th Assembly District

Jill Billings
State Representative
95th Assembly District

Joan Ballweg
State Senator
14th Senate District

John Spiros
State Representative
86th Assembly District

William Penterman
State Representative
37th Assembly District

James Edming
State Representative
87th Assembly District

Samba Baldeh
State Representative
48th Assembly District

Calvin Callahan
State Representative
35th Assembly District

Rob Summerfield
State Representative
67th Assembly District

Jon Plumer
State Representative
42nd Assembly District

Elijah Behnke
State Representative
89th Assembly District

Brad Pfaff
State Senator
32nd Senate District

Michael Schraa
State Representative
53rd Assembly District

Clint Moses
State Representative
29th Assembly District

Peter Schmidt
State Representative
6th Assembly District

Loren Oldenburg
State Representative
96th Assembly District

Travis Tranel
State Representative
49th Assembly District

Ty Bodden
State Representative
59th Assembly District

Katrina Shankland
State Representative
71st Assembly District

Nancy VanderMeer
State Representative
70th Assembly District